



"the World organization
for NDT"

INTERNATIONAL COMMITTEE FOR NON-DESTRUCTIVE TESTING

Notes of a WG1 meeting on NDT Qualification and Certification

Held in Valencia on 10th June 2011

Revision 2011-07-01)

1. Attendance:

Alexander Mullin, David Gilbert (observer), Francesco Delfini, Gerhard Aufricht, Rufino Teles Filho, John Thompson, John Zirnhelt, Matthias Purschke, Norikazu Ooka, Patrick Fallouey, Rodolfo Rodríguez, Sajeesh Kumar Babu, and Pui Kei Yuen (observer).

2. Apologies for absence:

David Barnet, RS Geng, Mike Farley, Hugh Neeson and Ron Nisbet.

3. The Minutes of the last meeting were confirmed accurate.

4. Actions were reviewed and the following were carried forward:

- a. **10/02: Messrs. Fallouey and Marshall** to explore possible WG1 members from North and central Africa.
- b. **10/12: JRT** to draft discussion paper on ICNDT assessment and certification of second party approval systems in the workplace.

See Annex B for updated meetings action list

5. Comments received on MRA and PCB systems

- a. Comments had been received from only one ICNDT member, and it was considered that the comments submitted reflected a lack of understanding of the content and sense of the MRA and PCB approval systems, which most likely arose from a failure to actively participate in the work.
- b. It was also suspected that the ICNDT member concerned feared the liability and other consequences of formally recognising and advocating acceptance by the industry of certification issued by other personnel certification bodies. It was suggested that the ICNDT seek legal opinion, preferably from a North American advocate, whether participation as a signatory in the ICNDT MRA carried any potential for liability.

Action 11/01: ICNDT IEC to seek legal opinion

- c. The meeting reviewed comments received on MRA and PCB systems and agreed responses to be forwarded to ICNDT IEC (Annex A).

6. Discussion on the development of Project and Business plans associated with implementation of MRA and PCBA systems

7. Discussion of ideas and proposals for an ICNDT examination question bank.

- a. It was agreed to transmit a formal request to the EFNDT CEC to donate the EFNDT Question Bank to ICNDT (this action was discharged by JRT on 11th June at a meeting of the EFNDT CEC, which agreed to this formal request).
- b. There was considerable discussion on how this resource should be used, and it was decided that it should be made available for distribution to ICNDT members that committed to join the ICNDT MRA and register an NDT personnel Certification Body.
- c. It was suggested and agreed that it be provided only as an example of the level of difficulty and format of qualification examination questions, but that should a recipient wish to further develop the question bank and utilise the software, this would be permitted, but it would be made clear that ICNDT did not support the software and would not be responsible for updating the question bank.
- d. It was agreed that a small charge would be made to each ICNDT member provided with this resource, the level of which would be decided later, along with terms and conditions for release and use in the form of an ICNDT Operating Procedure, also to be developed by MP and reviewed by WG1 members before the Cancun meeting.

Action 11/02: MP (see [draft OP](#) submitted by MP 2011-06-28, which is distributed with these minutes for **review and comment by WG/1 members**)

8. Reports and actions from related meetings

a. A teleconference meeting of the [ICNDT IEC](#) had taken place on 6th May 2011, and the following actions had been allocated to WG1:

i) Provide information on ICNDT MRA to Hugo Eberhardt (eb@tuv.at), Chief Executive Officer at CEOC, with a view to seeking CEOC endorsement of the MRA.

Action 11/03: JRT

ii) Initiate reviews of

- WG1 Action Plan (item 10 below)
- ICNDT Guide (item 9 below)

iii) Plan Qualification, Certification and Accreditation workshops for

- PAC NDT (Cancun, October 2011) and
- WCNDT (Durban, April 2012).

b. JRT has been appointed ISO TC135 liaison to ISO CASCO WG 30, which was revising EN ISO/IEC 17024, and had previously distributed a [meeting report](#) and [work plan](#) covering this work, which was expected to culminate in the issue of an FDIS in January 2012.

c. JRT had attended an IAF WG meeting on development of an IAF MLA on ISO 17024 accreditation, and had previously distributed a [written report of the meeting](#).

d. PF reported verbally on the development of an ASME NDE personnel certification scheme (known as ANDE), indicating that this was initially primarily to cover the in-service NDE on nuclear plant. It was supported and funded by the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC) in the USA, but it might be anticipated that the requirement for 3rd party certification would eventually extend to cover in-service NDE of conventional plant covered by ASME regulations. [Document drafting](#) was in progress, and may take some considerable time, but the steering committee has indicated that the system should be ISO 9712 'compatible'. PF thought that this goal may be made more difficult if the system were to embody requirements for performance demonstration IAW ISO TS 11774, and psychometric grading principles. PF agreed to send a brief report for distribution to WG1 members.

Action 2011/04: JRT to provide PF's brief report to WG1 members

9. Updating the [ICNDT Guide](#)

a. Section 2 (9712) could not be updated before issue of FDIS 9712, and it was agreed that action in this regard would be decided and allocated at the Cancun meeting. Also upon issue of FDIS 9712, Appendix 8 should be updated to include MFT. The following work could be initiated sooner:

i) **Action 2011/05: JRT** to review and update Appendix 6

ii) **Action 2011/06: JRT** to condense and update Appendix 7

10. [Action plan](#)

WG1 reviewed and [updated its action plan](#) to 2014.

Action 2011/07: WG1 members to review and progress actions

11. Dates and location of next meeting

NOTE change to next meeting date: **1st October 2011**, Cancun, Mexico (PAC NDT)

Action 2011/08: WG1 members to advise chairman of intentions regarding attendance at this meeting as soon as possible.

END

Annex A - Comments on ICNDT MRA and PCBA, with WG1 responses

IEC teleconference of 6th may 2011 minutes record: "It was proposed that WG1 prepare a response to ASNT's comments and present this to the IEC who would then reply to ASNT on behalf of ICNDT. The response could, it was felt, form part of a 'Q&A' document that could be useful for others. In the meantime, OP18 would be 'parked' even though it had been officially approved by the PGP".

MRA

Comment: We did not identify significant value in the current MRA proposal, particularly for programs that are accredited. If accreditation has already been attained, it was not apparent what additional value the MRA would provide to those organizations.

WG1 proposed response: The signatories to the MRA are committed to promote the recognition and acceptance in their own country of the certificates issued by the PCBs that are registered under the MRA. For example, currently, no signatory to the EFNDT MRA would be obliged to promote recognition or acceptance of certification issued by a PCB that is not registered under the EFNDT MRA, therefore that PCB loses the benefit of promotion of its own system in over 20 countries in Europe and elsewhere. This would of course be magnified under a much larger ICNDT MRA.

PCBA

Comment: We had concerns about the PCB approval scheme. In particular, the role of individuals who have ties to NDT certification bodies raises questions about the independence/impartiality of the proposed assessment.

WG1 proposed response: Peer Assessment by necessity involves members of a peer group assigning independent and impartial assessors to critically assess the activities of others. ISO/IEC 17040 (Conformity assessment - General requirements for peer assessment of conformity assessment bodies and accreditation bodies) gives details of how such assessments are managed in an impartial manner.

The ICNDT CEC will ensure that assessors and decision makers are totally impartial in order to give confidence in the integrity of the scheme. Attention is drawn to ICNDT PCBA criteria for the selection and appointment of PCB assessors.

Comment: It is unclear how the PCB approval assessments would address the reality that certification requirements are not fully harmonized among countries and market segments. We did not see significant value in assessing against criteria that are not in line with the requirements where the certification will be utilized.

WG1 proposed response: Compliance with the applicable standards does not necessarily address local industry requirements, but it does facilitate recognition of harmonization with the general requirements.

Annex B – actions arising from the meeting on 2011-06-10

Ref	Action	Remarks/due date
10/02	Messrs. Fallouey and Marshall to explore possible WG1 members from North and central Africa.	16 th September 2011
10/12	JRT to draft discussion paper on ICNDT assessment and certification of second party approval systems in the workplace, circulating for comment by WG1 members	16 th September 2011
11/01	JRT to request ICNDT IEC to seek legal opinion regarding potential liability of ICNDT and/or its MRA participating members and registered PCBs.	16 th September 2011
11/02	OP on Question Bank terms and conditions of use to be reviewed by WG1 members before the Cancun meeting	16 th September 2011
11/03	JRT to provide information on ICNDT MRA to Hugo Eberhardt (eb@tuv.at), Chief Executive Officer at CEOC, with a view to seeking CEOC endorsement of the MRA.	16 th September 2011
11/04	JRT to distribute PF's brief report on ANDE developments to members for information purposes.	As and when meetings take place
11/05	JRT review and update Appendix 6 of the ICNDT Guide , circulating for comment by WG1 members	16 th September 2011
11/06	JRT review and update Appendix 7 of the ICNDT Guide , circulating for comment by WG1 members	16 th September 2011
11/07	WG1 members to review and progress actions in revised action plan	16 th September 2011
11/08	ICNDT WG1 Members to note change of date for next meeting and to advise chairman of intentions regarding attendance at this meeting.	ASAP